



Asian Literature and Translation

ISSN 2051-5863

<https://doi.org/10.18573/issn.2051-5863>

Vol 4, No. 1, 2017, 105-148

Dharmadinnā Becomes a Nun: A Story of Ordination by

Messenger from the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*

Translated from the Tibetan Version by Fumi Yao

<https://doi.org/10.18573/j.2017.10132>

Date Accepted: 01/02/17

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 4.0 International License(CC-BY-NC-ND). <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

©Fumi Yao



Cardiff University Press

Gwasg Prifysgol Caerdydd

**Dharmadinnā Becomes a Nun: A Story of Ordination by Messenger from the
Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya**

Translated from the Tibetan Version

Fumi Yao

This paper presents an annotated English translation of the story of the nun Dharmadinnā, translated here for the first time from the Tibetan translation of the *Kṣudrakavastu* of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*. The protagonist is not able to enter the religious life because of her prenatal engagement and is finally ordained by an exceptional style of ordination ceremony performed through a messenger.

The Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* is a massive monastic code (*vinaya*) belonging to the ancient Indian Buddhist school known as the Mūlasarvāstivāda. This *vinaya* preserves a huge treasury of narrative literature, which developed in the tradition of this school. This text provides a story of a woman who experienced a certain serious difficulty in becoming a nun and was ordained in a special way. In the story, a young woman, Dharmadinnā, longs to lead the religious life as a nun, but is refused permission to do so by her father because of her engagement, which was made before her birth. Consequently, the Buddha permits the community of nuns to perform a series of ordination

ceremonies for Dharmadinnā at home through a special means, namely, a messenger.¹

This story has attracted scholarly attention in recent years, both from the perspectives of studies of monastic rules and of narratives. The narrative recounts an important exception to the rules for female ordination, which is usually supposed to take place in the communities of nuns and monks. Presented in the form of an *avadāna*, it tells a unique life story of one of the most eminent female disciples of the Buddha and provides interesting narrative material concerning the conflict between marriage and the religious life of a woman.² Though a number of scholars have already introduced this story to the academic world through brief or detailed summaries, there has been no published translation of it in any modern language yet.³ Here I would like to present my translation of the story.

In the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, the story of Dharmadinnā is placed in a chapter titled *Kṣudrakavastu*, “Chapter on Miscellany.” More precisely, in that chapter the story is in a section

¹ There are *sūtras* which contain the sermon given by the nun Dharmadinnā (Pāli Dhammadinnā) to a lay-devotee Viśākha (Pāli Visākha) in the Chinese translation of the *Madhyamāgama* and Pāli *Majjhima Nikāya* (MĀ 210; MN 44). A version of this sermon appears as a full quotation in the *Abhidharmakośaṭīkopāyikā* (no. 1005 in Honjō 2014, i: 64–74). These *sūtras* include no information of Dharmadinnā’s ordination. While these texts are silent about the personal relationships between the speaker and the listener, Viśākha/Visākha is mentioned as Dharmadinnā/Dhammadinnā’s former husband in Buddhaghosa’s commentary on the *Majjhima Nikāya* and Yaśomitra’s commentary on the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya* (Anālayo 2011b, 7; Yao 2015, nn. 22 and 59). In our present story, however, Viśākha is Dharmadinnā’s fiancé, who fails to marry her at the end of the story. For “former” spouses of Buddhist monks and nuns, see Clarke 2014a, esp. 78–119. For a comparative study of the three parallels above and an English translation of the *Abhidharmakośaṭīkopāyikā* version, see Anālayo 2011b.

² For a study on Dharmadinnā’s story in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, focused on the peculiarity of it compared with parallel accounts of ordination by messenger in other extant *vinayas*, see Yao 2015.

³ Panglung 1981, 197; Finnegan 2009, 156–160, 180–182, 201–210; Muldoon-Hules 2010, 303–305; Clarke 2014a, 48–50, 189, 190; Karashima and Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya 2015, 213 n. 88; Yao 2015, 221–223. There is a translation of the story from the Chinese version into classical Japanese in *kakikudashi* style (Nishimoto 1935, 233–243).

dealing with rules for managing the community of nuns. The *Kṣudrakavastu* is extant only in Chinese and Tibetan translations, the Sanskrit version being lost. The exact location of the story in question is as follows:

- Tibetan: 'Dul ba phran tshegs kyi gzhi (D 6, 'Dul ba Da 160b6–170a6; P Ne 155b2–164b7; S Tha 239b6–254a3)
- Chinese: *Genbenshuoyiqieyoubu pinaiye zashi* 根本說一切有部毘奈耶雜事 (T. 1451, 24.366b14–369b16)

These two translations of Dharmadinnā's story generally correspond well to each other.

The story of the ordination of Dharmadinnā has at least two parallels in Indian Buddhist literature, both of which exist only in Tibetan translation today and are regarded as belonging, or being closely related, to the narrative tradition of the Mūlasarvāstivāda; one is in Śamathadeva's *Abhidharmakośaṭīkopāyikā*, a commentary on the *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*,⁴ and another in the *Karmaśataka*, a collection of *avadāna* stories.⁵ While what the *Abhidharmakośaṭīkopāyikā* gives is a shorter version of the story in the *Kṣudrakavastu* quoted without mention of the source, the story

⁴ D 4094, *mNGon pa* Ju 214a3ff.; Honjō 2014, ii: 538–540 (Japanese translation).

⁵ D 340, *mDo sde* Ha 135a4–142a6 (Chapter 36). Feer 1901, 267–271 (French summary); Matsumoto 2005 (Japanese translation including a comparison with the Dharmadinnā story from the *Kṣudrakavastu*); Jampal and Fischer forthcoming (English translation).

A manuscript, which consists of an *avadāna* anthology, *vinaya* excerpts, and *sūtra* excerpts, discovered in Merv, Turkmenistan, contains a brief reference to Dharmadinnā's story in the *avadāna* section; see Karashima and Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya 2015, 212–213. This manuscript is assumed to date back to the fifth century C.E. and belong to the Śarvāstivādins (with this name, Karashima refers to the school that includes the groups who transmitted the *Shisong lü* 十誦律, the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, and most probably other *vinayas* lost today); it includes a great number of parallels to the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* and other closely related texts (*ibid.*, 146–148).

in the *Karmaśataka* is significantly different from our story in many parts of its plot. Though there is a record that suggests that our story was once extracted from the *Kṣudrakavastu* and circulated as a single *sūtra* during the Tang period in China, the *sūtra* no longer survives.⁶ Stories about the rule for ordination by messenger in other *vinayas* share few elements with the story in the *Kṣudrakavastu* in respect of both plot and characters.⁷

The present translation is based on the Derge xylograph of the Tibetan version; the sTog Palace manuscript and Peking xylograph are noted only in regard to significant differences. Page numbers of the Taishō edition for the Chinese version and folio numbers of the three Tibetan editions are inserted in the main text of the translation. In the footnotes, I compare details of the Tibetan version with the Chinese version and other parallels.

The Translation

Engagement and Birth of Dharmadinnā and Viśākha

The Buddha, the Blessed One, was staying in the Jetavana, in the Park of Anāthapiṇḍada near Śrāvastī.⁸

⁶ See Yao 2015, 230–231.

⁷ See Yao 2015, esp. 225–229, and the footnotes to the present translation.

⁸ Ch.: *yuanchu tongqian* 緣處同前 “The place of the story is the same as the above.” However, the passage just before this starts with the same wording (*yuanchu tongqian*) and the passage before that starts *yuán zài wángshèchéng* 緣在王舍城 “The story is in the city of Rājagṛha.” This does not seem to be an important difference but rather a careless mistake, because afterwards the name of the place is mentioned as *shiluofacheng* 室羅伐城 “the city of Śrāvastī” (T. 24.367b13–14).

In a place in Śrāvastī lived a householder named Byin pa,⁹ who was very (S 240a) wealthy, had great riches, many possessions, and a large family and who possessed wealth like that of Vaiśravaṇa (the god of riches) and matched Vaiśravaṇa in wealth. He took a wife from a family that was equal to his, and they made love.

In another place lived a householder named Ri dags sgra,¹⁰ (D 161a) who, also, was very wealthy, had great riches, many possessions, and a large family and who possessed wealth like that of Vaiśravaṇa and matched Vaiśravaṇa in wealth. He, also, took a wife from a family that was equal to his, and they made love. They (the two householders) were equal to each other in riches and one said: “I am superior to you in possessions,” and the other also said: “I am superior to you in possessions.” They became friends. One occasionally sent presents to the other and the other also sent presents [back], and the two became friends.

Later, many people living in Śrāvastī had some business and they all went to a park, assembled, arranged matters of the city, and departed. The two householders Byin pa and Ri dags sgra stayed

⁹ Skt. unknown; Ch. *tianyu* 天與 “Given by a god” (*Devadatta?). Skt. can be reconstructed from Tib. as *Datta (Feer 1901, 267; Matsumoto 2005, 178; Finnegan 2009, 157) or *Dinna (cf. Edgerton [1953] 1998, i §34.16). Given the name of Byin pa’s daughter Dharmadinnā, *Dinna looks more likely.

¹⁰ Skt. unknown; Ch. *luzi* 鹿子 “deer” (*Mṛga [cf. *milijashe* (*Mṛgajā): *luzi* 密栗迦闍: 鹿子), T 23.952a17, *luzi* being Yijing’s annotation] or *Mṛgāra [cf. *luzimu* 鹿子母/Mṛgāramātr, frequently seen in Ch.]?). Skt. can be reconstructed from Tib. as *Mṛgasvara, *Mṛgaghoṣa, *Mṛgaśabda, etc. Though D, P, and S agree in reading *ri dags sgra*, and the Phug brag manuscript (Tha 203a4) supports this, the Narthang xylograph (Da 426b5) and the London manuscript (Na 109b7) read *ri dwags sgra*. I cannot say for certain whether these variants are related to the textual transmission of the Kanjur or they represent only a minor orthographical difference unrelated to it. Yet it may be worth noting that the Narthang edition, despite its almost consistent spelling *ri dwags* in our story in the *Kṣudrakavastu*, seems not to do so in the *Pravrajyāvastu* (see Eimer 1983 ii, e.g. 51, 53–57, 115, 121, 194, 235, 335) and not necessarily even in other parts of the *Kṣudrakavastu* (e.g. Tha 12a2, 71a5, Da 105b3). *Karmaśataka* 36 gives Ri dags ’dzin, *Mṛgāra (Matsumoto 2005, 178. “*Mṛgagraha” in Feer 1901, 267).

together having a friendly conversation. The householder Byin pa asked: “My friend, (S 240b) even after we both die, our friendship should continue uninterrupted until our sons, grandsons, great-grandsons, and great-great-grandsons. (P 156a) How can we do this?”

Ri dags sgra said: “My friend, that is great. So too have I thought. Now we shall make ourselves kin before our children are born. If I have a son and you have a daughter, give her to my son. Or if you have a son and I have a daughter, I will give her to your son.”

He (Byin pa) said: “My friend, that is great. Let us do so.” They thus made themselves kin before their children were born, and departed.

After that, the householder Byin pa’s wife conceived a child. After eight or nine months, a girl was born.¹¹ She was beautiful, charming, and pleasant to look at and every major limb and minor limb of her body was complete. (D 161b) She always cried. Later, when monks¹² came to the householder Byin pa’s house and preached the Dharma, she listened to it eagerly. For three times seven, [i.e.] twenty-one, days¹³ the householder held a great celebration of her birth and, wishing

¹¹ “After eight or nine months” is a stock phrase about childbirth in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* and related literary works, such as the *Dīvyāvadāna*. Childbirth is said to take place “in Week Thirty-eight,” i.e., in the ninth month, according to the *Garbhāvagrāntisūtra* in the *Kṣudrakavastu*. For details of this *sūtra* and ancient Indian medical texts referring to the gestation period, see Kritzer 2014, esp. 19–20. Hiraoka has noticed that in Ch. of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* most examples of this stock phrase are silent about the duration (so is Ch. of the present story) or say “after nine/ten months,” and the occurrences of “after eight or nine months,” which correspond to Skt, are rather rare. See Hiraoka 2002, 157, 433–434 n. 14. For examples in other *vinaya* texts, see Hiraoka 2002, 191–192.

¹² In *Karmaśataka* 36, the visitor to Dharmadinnā’s house is Mahāprajāpatī Gautamī (D 340, *mDo sde* Ha 135b5).

¹³ Skt. **trīṇi saptakāny ekaviṃśatidivasān* (cf., for instance, Yamagiwa 2001, 64); Tib. *nyi ma bdun gsum nyi shu rtsa gcig tu*; Ch. *san qiri hou* 三七日後 “after three times seven days.” The parallel sentence appearing a few lines later in Tib. is slightly different, albeit the same in meaning: *zhag bdun gsum nyi shu rtsa gcig gi bar du*. For parallels of the stock phrase about the celebration of birth and naming of a child, see Hiraoka 2002, 161–162.

to give a name to the baby, asked: “What name shall we give this girl?”

His relatives said: “Since this girl, who always desires the Dharma, listens to the Dharma eagerly and is the daughter of the householder Byin pa, let us name this girl (S 241a) Dharmadinnā.”¹⁴

The girl Dharmadinnā was entrusted to eight nurses,¹⁵ two of whom were nurses to suckle the baby, two of whom were nurses to carry the baby, two of whom were nurses to wipe excrement off the baby’s body and two of whom were nurses to play with the baby. The eight nurses raised the baby on milk, fermented milk, butter, butter oil,¹⁶ and other fine food and she soon grew like a lotus that stands in a pond. Later, the householder Ri dags sgra heard that the householder Byin pa had had a daughter (T. 366c) and thought: “Since my friend has had a daughter, I shall send her clothes and ornaments.” Thinking that she would be his son’s wife, he sent her clothes and ornaments and sent a message: “My friend, I am very glad to hear that you have a daughter. I am

¹⁴ Tib. *chos sbyin/ chos sbyin ma*; Ch. *fayu* 法與 “Given (by?) the Dharma.” Though D, P, and S agree in the above reading, the Phug brag manuscript (Tha 203b8), the Narthang xylograph (Da 427b5), and the London manuscript (Na 110b) read *chos byin* at the first occurrence of the name and give *chos sbyin/chos sbyin ma* later. Though this name was reconstructed by Panglung (1981, 197) and Finnegan (2009, 157ff.) as “Dharmadattā” and likewise by Feer based on *Karmaśataka* 36 (1901, 267), the original Sanskrit name Dharmadinnā is attested by a number of materials (in addition to the sources listed in Yao 2015, n. 19, we now have the Merv *avadāna* manuscript as a witness; see Karashima and Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya 2015, 212).

¹⁵ For Skt. sources for this stock passage, “The girl/boy was entrusted ... like a lotus that stands in a pond,” see Hiraoka 2002, 162–163. The stock passage is abbreviated in Ch.: *fu ba yangmu enci fuyu. su bian zhangda ru lian chushui*. 付八養母恩慈撫育。速便長大如蓮出水。“They entrusted her to eight nurses and raised her, taking good care. She grew up quickly like a lotus that emerges from water.”

¹⁶ In the stock phrase about a child’s growth usually five types of dairy products are mentioned: *kṣīra*, *dadhi*, *navanīta*, *sarpis*, and *sarpirmaṇḍa* (see the previous note). However, the fifth of these, *sarpirmaṇḍa*, is omitted here and in the following parallel about Viśākha. At least five parallels of this stock passage found in the *Kṣudrakavastu*, despite some variety of translation, all give the names of the five foods including the fifth: *mar gyi snying khu* = **sarpirmaṇḍa* (D Tha 19a1; 80b2; 174a5; 269b4; Da 30a7). For these five and other dairy products explained in Pāli and Vedic literature, see Nishimura 2014 and Hirata et al. 2013.

sending clothes and ornaments for my friend's (P 156b) daughter. Please accept them.”

Having accepted them, the householder Byin pa sent a message in turn: “My friend, it is good of you to do this. We have made ourselves kin. If you have a son, I shall give her to him.”

The householder Ri dags sgra heard that. As he desired a son, he and his wife made love. After they made love, his wife conceived a child. After eight or nine months, a boy was born. After the boy was born, for three times seven, [i.e.] twenty-one, days there was likewise a great celebration of his birth, (S 241b) and the householder asked: “What name shall we give this boy?”

(D 162a) His relatives said: “Since this boy was born under the constellation Viśākha, let us name this boy Viśākha.”¹⁷

Thus the boy was named Viśākha. The boy Viśākha, too, was entrusted to eight nurses, two of whom were nurses to suckle the baby, two of whom were nurses to carry the baby, two of whom were nurses to wipe excrement off the baby's body, and two of whom were nurses to play with the baby. The eight nurses raised the baby on milk, fermented milk, butter, butter oil, and other fine food and he soon grew like a lotus that stands in a pond.¹⁸ The householder Byin pa heard that the householder Ri dags sgra had had a son and thought: “Since my friend has had a son, who will certainly be my son-in-law, I shall send him clothes and ornaments.” He sent him clothes and

¹⁷ Tib. *sa ga* (cf. Mvy 3200); Ch. *pishequ* 毘舍佉 (a phonetical transliteration of Viśākha). Cf. Viśākha in Pāli (MN i: 299), as the nun Dhammadinnā's former husband in the Pāli tradition (see note 1). In *Karmaśataka* 36, Viśākha is born before Dharmadinnā.

¹⁸ The stock passage is abbreviated again in Ch.

ornaments and sent a message: “My friend, I am very glad to hear that you have a son. I am sending clothes and ornaments for my friend’s son. Please accept them.”

Having accepted them, the householder Ri dags sgra sent a message in turn: “My friend, when your daughter has grown, I will accept her.”

He (Byin pa) said: “This is great. Since my daughter is already betrothed, let us do so.”

Dharmadinnā Enters Religious Life at Home

When the girl Dharmadinnā had grown up, she wished to go forth. (S 242a) She bowed low until her forehead touched the feet of her father and asked: “Father, I hope to go forth in the well-taught Dharma and Vinaya.”¹⁹

He (the father) (P 157a) replied: “My daughter, you are already betrothed to Ri dags sgra’s son Viśākha. He is your (future) husband. Now it (your going forth) should not be allowed,”²⁰ and he did not allow (her to go forth). A nun called Utpalavarṇā²¹ occasionally visited the house to teach the family. Dharmadinnā asked her: “Noble One, I hope to go forth and be ordained in the

¹⁹ In *Karmaśataka* 36, Dharmadinnā receives the (three) refuges and *bslab pa’i gzhi rnams* “precepts” (lit. “the basis of training,” Skt. **śikṣāpadāni*) and realizes the fruit of not-returning at home before she asks her father for permission to go forth. There is no mention of a messenger in this passage (D 340, *mDo sde Ha* 136a2). Though it is not clearly stated which “precepts” the words *bslab pa’i gzhi rnams* means in this passage in the *Karmaśataka* story, it must be only the five precepts for a lay-devotee, for later in the story Dharmadinnā accepts the ten precepts for a novice.

²⁰ *D da ni gnang du mi rung ngo* “Now ...”; *P des na* ... “Therefore ...”; *S ngas* ... “By me ...”

²¹ Tib: *utpa la’i kha dog*; Ch. *lianhuase* 蓮華色 “Color of Lotus Blossom.” *Karmaśataka* 36 does not include any passages about Utpalavarṇā and the ordination ceremony performed through her as a messenger, which is one of the most significant differences between the *Karmaśataka* version and the *Kṣudrakavastu* version. *Karmaśataka* 36 directly proceeds from Dharmadinnā’s first asking for permission to go forth to her father’s invitation to the Buddha.

well-taught Dharma and Vinaya, and attain nunhood, but my father does not allow it and guards me, preventing me even from going out. Could you let me go forth in this very place?"

(D 162b) She (Utpalavarṇā) replied: "Girl, it is great that you have such an aspiration. Desire leads to little happiness, much pain, and many faults. Going forth is good. The Blessed One has said that if a learned person sees five kinds of faults, it is not suitable for that person to enjoy five kinds of desires. What are the five? (1) When a learned person has correctly seen that desire leads to little happiness and much pain and many faults, it is not suitable that the person enjoys desires. (2) When a learned person has correctly seen that because of enjoying desires fetters increase, it is not suitable that the person enjoys desires. (3) When a learned person has correctly seen that if one enjoys desires, it is not suitable and that there is (S 242b) no contentment [there], no satisfaction [there], it is not suitable that the person enjoys desires. (4) When a learned person has correctly seen that if one enjoys desires, there is no sin which will not be committed, it is not suitable that the person enjoys desires. (5) When a learned person has seen that the Buddha, the disciples of the Buddha, and the best people who have learned and correctly gone, have abandoned such different desires, it is not suitable that the person enjoys desires.

"When a learned person has seen five good qualities, it is suitable that the person believes in going forth. What are the five? (1) Having seen 'I will attain unshared merit,' it is suitable that a learned person (T. 367a) believes in going forth. (2) Having seen 'People whose slave and servant I

was, who ordered and employed me, and whom I satisfied now honor and praise me,' (P 157b) it is suitable that a learned person believes in going forth. (3) Having seen 'I will attain the highest meditation, happiness, and *nirvāṇa*,' it is suitable that a learned person believes in going forth.²² (4) Having seen 'If I cannot attain the highest meditation, happiness, and *nirvāṇa*, I will be reborn among gods,' it is suitable that a learned person believes in going forth. (5) Having seen that the merit of going forth is (D 163a) praised by the Buddha, (S 243a) the disciples of the Buddha, and the best people who have learned and correctly gone, it is suitable that a learned person believes in going forth.²³ Since it is indeed great that you have such an aspiration, I shall go and ask the Blessed One."

The nun Utpalavarṇā went to the Blessed One. When Utpalavarṇā had arrived, she bowed low until her forehead touched the feet of the Blessed One to show her deference, and sat down to one side. When she had sat down to one side, the nun Utpalavarṇā said to the Blessed One: "Reverend One, the daughter of a householder named Byin pa, whose name is Dharmadinnā, hopes to go forth and be ordained in the well-taught Dharma and Vinaya, and attain nunhood. But she has been betrothed to the householder Ri dags sgra's son, whose name is Viśākha, and the householder Byin pa²⁴ does not allow her to go forth. In addition, he always guards her, preventing her from

²² In Ch., the order of the third and the fourth members of this list is reversed.

²³ This teaching of the fivefold fault of desires and the fivefold good qualities of going forth appears frequently in the *Kṣudrakavastu*: Tha 100a7–b4/T 24.244b4–13, 207a1–5/276c19–20, 208a7–b2/277b6–14, 218a3–4/280c1, 232b2–3/285b5, Da 135a3–b3/357b3–17, 139a1–2/358c21–23.

²⁴ Ch. *fumu* 父母 "(her) father and mother."

going out.”

Then the Blessed One said to the Venerable Ānanda: “Ānanda, go and instruct the nuns: ‘I (the Blessed One) authorize you to confer, by sending Utpalavarṇā as messenger, the three refuges and the five precepts upon the householder Byin pa’s daughter Dharmadinnā in her own house (S 243b) and let her go forth in that very place.’”²⁵

“Certainly, Reverend One” replied the Venerable Ānanda to the Blessed One, and he went to the nuns. The Order of nuns gave instructions to the nun Utpalavarṇā, (P 158a) and sent her as a messenger. She went there (Dharmadinnā’s house) and said: “Girl, the Blessed One said he authorizes it, too. And also the Order of nuns has conferred the three refuges and the five precepts of a lay-devotee upon you. You have also gone forth and been given the ten precepts (of a novice). Therefore you must hold these precepts as established and make firm your conduct.”

(D 163b) She (Dharmadinnā) was greatly pleased. Then when she was greatly pleased and as soon as she listened to the nun Utpalavarṇā explaining the Four Truths of the Noble Ones so that she could correctly realize them, Dharmadinnā leveled the twenty peaks of the mountain chain of

²⁵ In Ch., this instruction includes *tifa* 剃髮 “shaving the hair” and *shou qi shixue* 受其十學 “accepting those ten precepts” as well as conferring the three refuges and the five precepts. Since, according to the procedure for going forth established in the *Kṣudrakavastu*, going forth requires not only the three refuges and the five precepts for a lay-devotee but also acceptance of the ten precepts, Ch. makes better sense. In Tib., a few lines after this, the ten precepts are mentioned as having been given to Dharmadinnā: “You have also gone forth and been given the ten precepts.” For the lay-devotee initiation procedure, see Da 105a1–105b4/T. 24.351c10–24; the going forth procedure, Da 105b4–107a4. In Ch. the passage including the going forth and following ordination procedures is missing and preserved in another text, the *Genbenshuoyiqieyoubu baiyijiemo* 根本說一切有部百一羯磨 (T. 1453, 24.459c10–465a20, **Ekottarakarmaśataka*). See Kishino 2015, 151 and 170 n. 18; Yao 2015, 220–221).

the false view of individuality with the vajra of knowledge and realized the fruit of stream-entry (*śrotāpatti*).²⁶ Then the nun Utpalavarṇā reported this to the Blessed One and the Blessed One ordered the Venerable Ānanda: “Go and instruct the nuns: ‘Give Dharmadinnā, in that very house, the two years’ training that consists of the six rules (*dharma*) and the six subordinate rules (*anudharma*) (of a probationer),²⁷ sending Utpalavarṇā (S 244a) as messenger.”

“Certainly, Reverend One,” replied the Venerable Ānanda, (T. 367b) and he instructed the nuns as he heard from the Blessed One. The Order of nuns gave instructions to Utpalavarṇā and sent her as messenger. She went there (Dharmadinnā’s house) and said: “Girl, the Order of nuns has given you the two years’ training that consists of the six rules and the six subordinate rules. Since you have become a nun,²⁸ you must do these things. Make firm your conduct as the precepts were

²⁶ Shenghai Li points out that the imagery of leveling the twenty peaks of the mountain chain of the false view of individuality (*satkāyadr̥ṣṭi*) with the vajra of knowledge is said to be seen in “*āgama*,” which can refer to the *vinaya* texts, by Candrakīrti (Li 2012, 276 n.169). For Skt. and Ch. parallels of the stock phrase including this, see Hiraoka 2002, 183–184.

²⁷ *chos drug dang rjes su 'brang ba'i chos drug gi bslab pa*. The original Sanskrit words *ṣaḍ dharmāḥ* and *ṣaḍ anudharmāḥ* are found in Mvy 9320 and 9321 and a few Mūlasarvāstivādin *vinaya* texts such as the *Varṣāvastu*, the *Bhikṣuṇīkarmavācānā*, and the *Vinayasūtra* (see Shōno 2010, 56; Schmidt 1993, 253; Bapat and Gokhale 1982, 52). Note, however, Mvy’s Tibetan translation for the latter, *rjes su mthun pa'i chos drug*, is different from that in the *Kṣudrakavastu* and agrees with that in the *Bhikṣuṇīprātimokṣa* and the *Bhikṣuṇīvinayavibhaṅga* (D 4, Ta 19a2–4; D 5, Ta 282b4ff.).

The precepts of a probationer (*sikṣamāṇā*) differ between *vinayas*; see Hirakawa [1964] 2000, 242–250 (265–267 for notes) and 1998, 553–560 (575 for notes) and Heirman 2002, i 67–75. For the six rules and six subordinate rules of the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, these two scholars base their studies on the Chinese translation; for the Skt. and Tib. sources, see Chung 2006, 8 and Kishino 2015, 175 n. 45. As stated by Hirakawa (1998, 556), the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* is peculiar in referring to “the six subordinate rules” in addition to the “the six rules”; the other *vinayas* give only “the six rules,” except for the *vinayas* of the Mahāsāṅghikas and the Mahāsāṅghika-Lokottaravādins, which list eighteen rules. On “the six subordinate rules” as evidence for the Merv manuscript’s (see note 5) close relationship to the *vinaya* tradition of the Mūlasarvāstivāda, see Clarke 2001, 91–92 (also 2015, 71). *Karmaśataka* 36 does not mention the six subordinate rules but only the six rules (D 340, *mDo sde* Ha 137a3); this is consistent with *Karmaśataka* 36’s closer relationship to other *vinayas* than the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya* in terms of the ordination procedure of the protagonist. See Yao 2015, 231–233.

²⁸ *khyod ni dge slong mar gyur gyis*. Ch., however, reads: *ru jin yishi zhengxuenü*. 汝今已是正學女。 “You are now a probationer (*sikṣamāṇā*).” Here again, according to both the plot of this story and the

established.” Then, having heard the Dharma being explained, Dharmadinnā realized the fruit of once-returning (*sakṛdāgāmiṃphala*).

Preparation of Wedding

Thus Dharmadinnā was trained in the six rules and the six subordinate rules for two years (P 158b) and became a young woman. She looked youthful and beautiful and all her relatives looked at her again and again, with their minds pleased. Then the householder Ri dags sgra heard that the girl Dharmadinnā had become a young woman and he sent a message to the householder Byin pa: “My friend, since the boy has become a young man and the girl, also, a young woman, I would like to arrange a good date and accept her as my boy’s wife.”

He (Byin pa) (S 244b) sent a message in turn: “My friend, that is great. Let us do so.”

The householder Byin pa assembled astrologers and asked: “Now, (D 164a) examine when I should give this girl as a bride.” They, uniting efforts with each other, calculated and pointed out the date to give her as a bride. Like that the householder Ri dags sgra pointed out the day to accept the bride. Then the householder Byin pa sent a message to houses of his friends, brothers, and relatives: “On this date my daughter Dharmadinnā should be given as a bride. Brothers and relatives, come with your attendants to help us.”

procedure for becoming a nun established in the *Kṣudrakavastu*, Ch. makes better sense (for the *śikṣamāṇā* procedure, Da 107a4–108a6; the *bhikṣuṇī* ordination, Da 108a6–120b1). See note 25.

Then the householder Ri dags sgra, also, sent a letter like that to the houses of his friends, brothers, and relatives. Because the two householder's friends, brothers, and relatives accompanied by their people and attendants assembled, Śrāvastī was totally filled with them. King Prasenajit of Kosala's consorts, princes, officers, many citizens, and provincial dwellers heard that the householder Byin pa's daughter had been betrothed to Ri dags sgra and that she was going to be accepted as a bride and their friends, brothers, relatives, and many people had assembled. He (the king) ordered the officers: "Hey, you also must help these two." They (S 245a) also sent letters to rulers of different places and people who belong to the Kshatriya caste: "Gather, bringing by yourselves all things that there are in each region today. Here you all must come and gather." (P 159a) As soon as they (who had received the letters) heard that, they likewise assembled in Śrāvastī, bringing with them whatever they had. Then hundreds of thousands of living beings assembled, too. Then the officers had all parks, gardens, and their surroundings in Śrāvastī cleaned.²⁹ All stones, pebbles, and gravel were removed. Sandalwood water was sprinkled, sweet-smelling censers were arranged and set on the right and left sides of the street, tassels and banners were placed, silk strings were hung, and various flowers (D 164b) were scattered and it was like the pleasant divine Nandana park and garden.³⁰

²⁹ For Skt. and Ch. parallels of the following stock phrase, "All stones, pebbles ... like a pleasant divine Nandana park and garden," see Hiraoka 2002, 156 and 433 n. 12.

³⁰ *yid du 'ong ba'i lha rnams kyi dga' ba'i tshal dang/ skyed mos tshal bzhin no//*. However, the probable Skt. for this phrase, *ramaṇīyaṃ devānām iva nandanavanodyānam*, seems to be better translated: "pleasant like the divine garden (named) Nandana park." Cf. *lha rnams kyi dga' tshal gyi skyed mos tshal bzhin du dga' dga' ltar byas te/* "having made it pleasant like the divine garden, Nandana park" (D

Then Dharmadinnā, having seen the preparation, asked the kinsmen: “Hey, what is this sudden festival?”

They answered: “Because you have had good moral preparation before, a great festival is held all of a sudden. In order to give you as a bride, a great festival is held all of a sudden. Thus those people have come.”

Having heard that, she was terrified and threw herself at her father’s (S 245b) feet, and asked: “Father, because I have no desires, please allow me to go to the nunnery called King’s Garden.”

He replied: “Girl, since you have been betrothed to the householder Ri dags sgra’s son Viśākha, now it is beyond my power. He is your husband. This is known to King Prasenajit of Kosala, (T. 367c) his consorts, princes, officers, male servants, female servants, many citizens, and many people who came together from each country, too. How then can I give you permission? Do I desire that my friends, brothers, and relatives be imprisoned and die? Think to yourself that you shall go as a bride. My friends, my people, kinsmen, and a great many people have also assembled here. So, do not say that. Since you are quite young, you do not understand. Give up leading the pure life.”

The Buddha’s Prediction

1, *Dul ba* Nga 204b7; Sbhv ii: 140.7). See also Hiraoka 2002, 433 n. 12; Mvy 4194.

She vigorously practiced meditation, in which she concentrated her mind on the path (P 159b), not having yet attained the means of [fully] freeing [herself] from desire.

On this occasion,³¹ there is nothing the Buddhas, blessed ones, do not know, see, comprehend, or understand. The Buddhas, blessed ones, have great compassion, (S 246a) have been of benefit to worldly beings, and each of them is a singular protector, a singular hero, one who is without a second (i.e. matchless) and is never double-tongued,³² who abides in tranquility and insight, (D 165a) who knows the three essences of self-control,³³ who has crossed the four rivers, who stands firm on the four elements of supernatural power, who is not afraid because of the four fearlessnesses,³⁴ who has abandoned the five elements, who has completely gone beyond the five kinds of birth,³⁵ who possesses the six elements, who fulfills the six perfections, who always practices the six deeds,³⁶ who is ornamented with the seven flowers of elements of enlightenment,

³¹ This stock passage “On this occasion, ... the time to lead his children,” appears twice in the *Saṅghabhedavastu* (Sbhv ii: 53 and 156–157). Tib., Ch., and these parallels in the *Saṅghabhedavastu* are different from each other regarding a number of points. For other Skt. sources and Ch. parallels, see Hiraoka 2002, 172–173 and 438 n. 53–54. See also Hiraoka 2007, i: 199–200, Hiraoka 2009, 48, and Rotman 2008, 182–184 along with comments by Hiraoka (2011, esp. 256).

³² *gnyis su ma yin par gsung ba* “(lit.) speaks not in twofold ways”; Skt. *advayavādin* “one who does not have twofold speech” (see Divy 95.13 and Mvy 23); Ch. *wu you er yan* 無有二言 “[he] does not have twofold speech.”

³³ Ch. gives *xianfa sanming, shanxiu sanxue, shantiao sanye* 顯發三明、善修三學、善調三業 “who has revealed the three kinds of cognition, well practiced the three kinds of discipline, and well controlled the three types of actions.”

³⁴ Ch. and a parallel in the *Saṅghabhedavastu* above mentioned do not refer to the four fearlessnesses but give *yu changye zhong xiu sishexing* 於長夜中修四攝行; *caturṣu saṃgrahavastuṣu dīrgharātrakṛtaparicayānām* (Sbhv ii: 53.6–7) “has been familiar with the four kinds of objects of attraction for a long time.”

³⁵ Ch. gives *shechu wugai* 捨除五蓋 “has abandoned five obstacles” before “has abandoned the five elements.”

³⁶ *spyad pa drug la rtag tu spyod pa*. Ch. and a parallel in the *Saṅghabhedavastu* do not include this phrase. On the other hand, Ch. provides *qicai pushi* 七財普施 “universally gives seven kinds of treasures,” which is seen neither in Tib. nor in Skt., after “the six perfections.”

who possesses the eight paths,³⁷ who knows the attainment of the nine successive stages,³⁸ who possesses ten kinds of powers, who has come to fame widely in the ten directions, and who has surpassed a thousand dominant beings.³⁹ They, for the three watches of the night and for the three watches of the day, look at the world with Buddha-eyes and enter into the insight of wisdom, thinking: “Who is in decline? Who is in increase? Who is in trouble? Who is in danger? Who is suffering harm? Who has difficulty, danger and harm? Who has sunk to an inferior state of life? Who has descended to an inferior state of life? Who have fallen down to an inferior state of life? Whom should I take out from an inferior state of life (S 246b) and place in heaven and liberation?⁴⁰ Whom should I make produce their yet unproduced roots of merit? Whose already produced (roots of merit) should I make mature? Whose already matured (roots of merit) should I liberate?”

And this is said:

³⁷ Before “possesses the eight paths” Ch. gives *li yu banan* 離於八難 “has left the eight dangers.”

³⁸ Before this phrase Ch. gives *yongduan jiuji* 永斷九結 “has broken nine fetters forever.” Cf. *navasamyojanavisamyojanakānām* (Divy 95.22; Hiraoka 2002, 438 n. 53).

³⁹ After this Ch. has *de fawuwei, xiangfu moyuan, zhen daleiyin, zuo shizihou* 得法無畏、降伏魔怨、震大雷音、作師子吼 “having attained the fearlessness (i.e. confidence) in [comprehension of] all *dharmas* (cf. Mvy 131), he defeats Māra, the enemy, creates a great roll of thunder, and makes a lion’s roar.” Cf. *udārārṣabhasamyakṣiṃhanādanādinām* (Divy 95.17; Hiraoka 2002, 438 n. 53).

⁴⁰ Ch. *xiang rentianlu anyinwuai qu niepancheng* 向人天路安隱無礙趣涅槃城 “let them proceed in the path to humans and gods and go smoothly to the city of nirvana without any obstacle.” Ch. gives a few sentences which are not seen in the parallels in the *Saṅghabhedavastu* but are in the *Divyāvadāna*: *shei xian yuni? shei neng shou hua? zuo he fangbian baji ling chu, wu shengcaizhe ling de shengcai, yi zhianshanna po wumingmo?* 誰陷欲泥。誰能受化。作何方便拔濟令出、無聖財者令得聖財、以智安膳那破無明膜。 “Who has sunk in the mud of desire? Who is able to be converted? Through which means shall I deliver them (from those states), let those who do not have noble wealth acquire noble wealth, and break the film of ignorance (covering their eyes) with collyrium of knowledge?” Cf. *kasya kāmapaṅkanimagnasya hastoddhāram anupradadyām/ kam āryadhanavirahitam āryadhanaiśvāryādhipatyē pratiṣṭhāpayāmi* (Divy 124.25–27); *kasyājñānatimirapaṭalaparyavanaddhanetrasya jñānāñjanaśalākayā cakṣur viśodhayeyam* (Divy 125.2–3).

Even if the ocean that is *makara*'s dwelling place might miss the time (of its tide),

The Buddha never misses the time to lead his children.⁴¹

After that, the Blessed One smiled.⁴² It is customary that whenever the Buddhas, (P 160a) blessed ones, smile, rays of blue, yellow, red, and white light emanate from their mouths. Some of the rays go below and some go above.

Those rays that go below go to the hells of Coming to Life Again (Saṃjīva), Black Cord (Kālasūtra), Being Crushed (Saṃghāta), Scream (Raurava), Great Scream (Mahāraurava), Heat (Tapana), Intense Heat (Pratāpana), (D 165b) Incessant Pain (Avīci), Blistering (Arbuda), Blister Opening (Nirarbuda), Crying Aṭaṭa (Aṭaṭa), Crying Hahava (Hahava), Crying Huhuva (Huhuva), Blue Lotus (Utpala), Red Lotus (Padma), and Large Red Lotus (Mahāpadma).⁴³ They fall cold to hells where it is hot and fall warm to hells where it is cold. Thus each of the various pains of those living beings in hell ceases. Therefore they (the living beings) (S 247a) think: “Oh, did we die in this hell, or were we reborn elsewhere?”

The Blessed Ones (T. 368a) send their magic creations so that the living beings will increase

⁴¹ Ch. gives another verse after this: *fo yu zhuyouqing cibei bu sheli siji qi kunan ru muniu suidu* 佛於諸有情 慈悲不捨離 思濟其苦難 如母牛隨犢 “The Buddha has compassion on living beings and does not abandon them/ He considers saving them from their suffering, like a cow following her own calf.” The Skt. parallel for this is not found in the *Saṅghabhedavastu* but in the *Divyāvadāna*: *sarvajñasantānanivāsini hi kāruṇyadhenur mrgayaty akhinnā/ vainejavatsān bhavaduḥkhanaṣṭān vatsān praṇaṣṭān iva vatsalā gauḥ//* (Divy 96.11–13; Hiraoka 2007, i: 200, 229 n. 8; Rotman 2008, 184)

⁴² Hereafter appears a lengthy stock passage, “It is customary ... The Blessed One said ‘Good, Ānanda ... without condition.’” For Skt. sources and Ch. parallels for this stock passage, see Hiraoka 2002, 175–178. See also Hiraoka 2002, 317–323, Hiraoka 2007, i: 143–144 and 148 n.8–150 n. 17; Rotman 2008, 136–139 and 417 n. 396–399.

⁴³ Ch. abbreviates the list of the hells: *qi guang xiazhe zhi wujianyu bing yudiyu*. 其光下者、至無間獄并餘地獄。 “Those rays that go below go to the hell of Incessant (Pain) and other hells.”

their faith. The living beings look at the magic creation and think: “Oh, we did not die in this hell, nor were we reborn elsewhere. Each of our various pains ceased on account of the power of this living being, a being we have never seen.”

Making their mind pure towards the magic creation, they exhaust the actions for perceiving the suffering of hell and are reborn among the gods and humans who will become vessels for seeing the Truths.

Those rays that go above go to the gods of the Four Great Kings (Cāturmahārājika), Thirty-three (Trāyastriṃśa), Conflict Free (Yāma), Content (Tuṣita), Enjoying Magical Creations (Nirmāṇarati), Controlling Enjoyments Magically Created by Others (Paranirmitavaśavartin), the gods of the Company of Brahman (Brahmakāyika), Ministers of Brahman (Brahmapurohita), Great Brahman (Mahābrahman), Little Light (Parīttābha), Immense Light (Apramāṇābha), Clear Light (Ābhāsvara), Little Virtue (Parīttāsubha), Immense Virtue (Apramāṇāsubha), Abundant Virtue (Śubhakṛtsna), Without Cloud (Anabhṛaka), Produced by Moral Merits (Puṇyaprasava), Ample Fruit (Bṛhatphala), Increasing No More (Abhṛha), Not Afflicted (Atapa), Excellent Appearance (Sudṛśa), Having Clear Sight (Sudarśa), and Being not Below Any Other (Akaniṣṭha).⁴⁴ They proclaim these words: “Impermanent, (P 160b) painful, empty, (S 247b) selfless” and speak these two verses:

⁴⁴ Ch. abbreviates the list of the heavens: *qi shangshengzhe zhi sejiujingtian*. 其上昇者至色究竟天。 “Those (rays) that go above go to the gods of the Ultimate in Form Realm (Akaniṣṭha).”

“Arise, go forth. Join in the Buddha’s teaching.

“Like an elephant destroying a house made of reeds, break the army of Death.

“Those who are not careless and act according to this Dharma and Vinaya,

“(D 166a) After abandoning the course of birth, bring an end to pain.”⁴⁵

Then these rays, after moving around the triple thousand great thousand worlds, go to the back of the Blessed One. There the rays disappear in the back of the Blessed One when the Blessed One hopes to explain the past.⁴⁶ They disappear in the front of the Blessed One when the Blessed One hopes to explain the future. They disappear in the sole of the foot when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth in the realms of hell. They disappear in the heel when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth among animals. They disappear in a big toe when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth among hungry ghosts. They disappear in the knees when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth among humans. They disappear in the left palm when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth as a wheel-turning king of power. They disappear in the right palm when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth as a wheel-turning king. (S 248a) They disappear in the navel when the Blessed One hopes to explain birth among gods. They disappear in the mouth when the Blessed One hopes to

⁴⁵ For a variety of occurrences of these two verses in the literature of the Mūlasarvāstivādins, Theravādins, and other schools, see Skilling 1999. For Ch. parallels, see Teiser 2006, 65.

⁴⁶ The word translated here as “explain” is Skt. *vyākṛ*; Tib. *lung ston pa*, which means predicting future events (Edgerton [1953] 1998, ii: s.v. *vyākṛoti*) as well as revealing past events as shown in this sentence (Hiraoka 2002, 407 n. 32). Cf. D 1, ‘*Dul ba Kha* 51a–b in the *Bhaiṣajyavastu*, as an example in which this stock passage about the Buddha’s smile is employed in the case of revealing a past event. The present translation uses “explain” here for both meanings mentioned above for consistency in this and following sentences. The word appears again in Da 169b7, where the present translation uses “predicted.”

explain the enlightenment of disciples. They disappear in the circle of hair between the eyebrows when the Blessed One hopes to explain the enlightenment of Self-enlightened Ones. They disappear in the top of the head when the Blessed One hopes to explain complete enlightenment.

At that time those rays, after circumambulating around the Blessed One three times, disappeared in the mouth of the Blessed One. Then the Venerable Ānanda made the gesture of supplication and asked the Blessed One:

“Thousands of assorted colors (P 161a) came forth from inside your mouth.

“Like the sun rising, they shone in every direction.”

And he also spoke these verses:⁴⁷

“The Buddhas, who are free from restlessness and have cast off discouragement and arrogance and who among living beings have become the highest cause,⁴⁸

“(D 166b) Victors who have conquered enemies, do not without a cause show their smile, which is white like a conch shell or the root of the lotus.

“Having⁴⁹ known that time by yourself with the resolute⁵⁰ mind, O Śramaṇa, Lord of Victors,

⁴⁷ Here occurs an error in the order of quarters of the stanzas in D (Da 166b1–2), in which the first half of the third stanza in the Tibetan translation is wrongly placed after the third quarter of the first stanza. The present translation is based on S Tha 248a6–7 and P Ne 161a2–3 and the Skt. parallel: *vīgatoddhavā dānyamadaprahīṇā buddhā jagaty uttamahetubhūtāḥ/ nākāraṇaṃ śaṅkhamṛṇālagauram smitam upadarśayanti jinā jitārayaḥ// tatkālam svayam adhigamya dhīra buddhyā śrotṛṇāṃ śramaṇa* (MS *śravaṇa) jinendra kāṅkṣitānām/ dhīrābhir munivṛṣa vāgbhir uttamābhir utpannam vyapanaya saṃśayaṃ śubhābhiḥ/ nākāsmāl lavaṇajalādrirājadhairyaḥ sambuddhāḥ smitam upadarśayanti nāthāḥ/ yasyārthe smitam upadarśayanti dhīrāḥ taṃ śrotuṃ samabhilaṣanti te janaughāḥ* (Sbhv ii: 163). See note 42.

⁴⁸ Tib. *sangs rgyas skye bo mchog gi rgyur gyur tel//*; Skt. *buddhā jagaty uttamahetubhūtāḥ/* (see the previous note). The present translation is based on Skt. in regard to interpreting *skye bo/jagati* as locative. Cf. *sangs rgyas 'gro nang mchog gi rgyur gyur pa//* (the *Bhaiṣajyavastu*, D 1, 'Dul ba Ka 292b7).

⁴⁹ In this verse, the present translation is based on the Skt. parallel (see note 47) because of the difficulty

“O Chief of Sages, with the best resolute beautiful words, please resolve uncertainty that has arisen for the listeners who are affected by doubt.

“Protectors or perfectly enlightened ones, who are resolute like the mountains in the middle of the ocean, do not smile abruptly.

“(T. 368b; S 248b) These many people beg to listen for what purpose the Resolute One showed the smile.”

The Blessed One said: “Good, good, Ānanda.⁵¹ Tathāgatas, Arhats, Perfectly Enlightened Ones do not smile without cause, without condition. Ānanda, to the girl Dharmadinnā the nun Utpalavarṇā was sent as a messenger by command of me and the Order of nuns, the three refuges were given and, in due course, having let her go forth, the two years’ training that consists of the six rules and the six subordinate rules was given. Do you see that she (Dharmadinnā) is going to be given as a bride tomorrow, wherefore many people have assembled?”

“I see, Reverend One.”

“Ānanda, there is no possibility, no reason that the girl will stay at home as a woman⁵² any

of interpreting the Tibetan translation: *de tshe nyid kyis rtogs shing bstan pa'i blo// nyan pa rgyal dbang las ni thos par 'tshal// thub pa khyu mchog brtan tshigs dam pas ni// the tshom skyes pa mchog gis bsal bar mdzod// Cf. de slad brtan pa nyid blos dus mkhyen nas// rgyal ba'i dbang po thub pa skyes kyi mchog// nyan par 'tshal ba'i nyan pa po rnams kyi// the tshom skyes pa gsung tshig brtan pa dang// dam pa bzang po dag gis bsal du gsol// (the Bhaiṣajyavastu, D 1, 'Dul ba Ka 292b7–293a1).*

⁵⁰ Given the Skt. *dhīrabuddhyā*, Tib. *bstan pa'i blo* (DSP) may have been originally *brtan pa'i blo(s)*. In another occurrence of Skt. *dhīra* in the next stanza, the word is translated as *brtan pa* “the Resolute One.”

⁵¹ *S de bzhin no// kun dga' bo de bzhin te/ kun dga' bo. DP de bzhin no// kun dga' bo* (without repetition). Ch.: *rushi rushi* 如是如是.

⁵² *D mi mo* “woman,” PS *khyim mi mo* “woman in house.”

more. She will not enjoy experience of desires in order to take pleasure. Now, having attained the fruit of not-returning (*anāgāmiṃphala*), she will realize the state of an *arhantī*. Ānanda, go and instruct the nuns: ‘Since Dharmadinnā has already been trained in the six rules and the six subordinate rules for two years, now send Utpalavarṇā as messenger and give Dharmadinnā the consent to enter the pure life [as a nun].’⁵³

“Certainly, Reverend One,” replied the Venerable (P 161b, S 249a) Ānanda to the Blessed One and he instructed the nuns thus. The Order of nuns also instructed Utpalavarṇā to act as messenger and sent her. She (Utpalavarṇā) went and said: “Girl, because the Order of nuns (D

⁵³ Tib. *tshangs par spyad pa skyed(S bskyed) pa 'i sdom pa* “consent that [she] generates(/has generated) pure practice (?)”; Skt. **brahmacaryopasthānasamvṛti*; Ch. *fanxing benfa* 梵行本法 “basic quality of pure practice (?)”. In the ordination procedure prescribed in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, a candidate who has completed her two year’s practice as a probationer is supposed to be bestowed by the Order what is referred to as *tshangs par spyad pa la nye bar gnas pa 'i sdom pa* (D 6, 'Dul ba Da 108a6ff. in the *Kṣudrakavastu* in Tibetan translation; T. 1453, 24. 461a18ff. and D 4118, 'Dul ba Wu 122b6ff. in the **Ekottarakarmaśataka* in Chinese and Tibetan translations). This is, according to Ryōji Kishino, given to the candidate as a certification that she is free from any physical problems that disqualify her for ordination (2015, 154). In his detailed study on this technical concept, Kishino convincingly demonstrates that the original Sanskrit for this term, *brahmacaryopasthānasamvṛti*, is well attested by Sanskrit texts (*ibid.*, 173 n. 32), despite the probably more common identification of Tib. *sdom pa* as a translation of *samvara* “vow.” Supporting Edgerton’s interpretation of *samvṛti* ([1953] 1998, ii: q.v.), he provides a number of examples of usage of the term *sdom pa* meaning “consent” or “permission” in *vinaya* contexts and also shows its interchangeability with another translation *gnang ba* “permission,” adding important examples to ones previously noted by Kieffer-Pülz (1992, 366–371) and Hu-von Hinüber (1994, 198–199). Thus it seems to be sound to interpret *samvṛti/sdom pa* as “consent,” “permission,” or “allowance” (Kishino 2015, 177 n. 56). One should notice that *samvṛti*, which is assumed to be “hyper-Skt.” for Pāli *sammuti* by Edgerton, seems not to signify directly “permission” but, as Kishino carefully elaborates, “a decision made by all the members of the *saṅgha*” to give permission (*ibid.*, 165); i.e. “permission” is only a consequence of *samvṛti* (“consent” could be a tricky translation in this regard). Otherwise one of the examples for *samvṛti* given by Edgerton would not make sense: *avandanārhasamvṛti*, agreement of nun’s Order that they should not pay homage to a specific monk.

Tshangs par spyad pa skyed pa 'i sdom pa in our story is included in the variety of translations of this *brahmacaryopasthānasamvṛti* (Kishino 2015, 167–168 n. 7). Kishino had to leave unclear the meaning of *upasthāna* in the Skt. compound and, consequently, what the word *brahmacarya*, “celibacy,” precisely indicates (e.g. the celibate life a candidate should have led for two years as a probationer; that she should lead henceforth as a nun; or a synonym for “ordination” ?); nevertheless, he provided a number of possible interpretations along with suggestive information (179–180 n. 69). I have at present no solution to these problems, hence my translation above, which I believe represents at least the function of the *brahmacaryopasthānasamvṛti* in the ordination procedure.

167a) bestowed the consent to enter the pure life upon you, now you should be ordained.”

As soon as she heard the Dharma being preached, she realized the fruit of not-returning and attained magical power. Utpalavarṇā went and reported this to the Blessed One. The Blessed One said to the Venerable Ānanda: “Ānanda, go and instruct the nuns: ‘With my (the Blessed One’s) authorization, the two Orders should send Utpalavarṇā as a messenger and ordain the girl Dharmadinnā.’”

“Certainly, Reverend One,” replied the Venerable Ānanda to the Blessed One and he instructed the nuns thus. The Order of nuns summoned both the Orders and ordained Dharmadinnā while she was still staying at home through Utpalavarṇā as a messenger. Utpalavarṇā went and told her (Dharmadinnā): “You have been authorized by the Blessed One. The two Orders have ordained you.”

(S 249b) Again, the Dharma was preached and when she had heard it,⁵⁴ the nun Dharmadinnā came to understand this very ever-moving wheel of transmigration, which consists of five parts, overthrew all conditioned states because of their character of falling, descending, destroying, and ruining,⁵⁵ abandoned all impurities,⁵⁶ realized the state of *arhat*, and became an *arhantī*. She was

⁵⁴ For Skt. sources and Ch. parallels for the following stock passage, “One came to understand ... Indra and Upendra,” see Hiraoka 2002, 170–171. Ch. is partially different from Tib. and Skt. as Hiraoka noted (2002, 438 n. 50).

⁵⁵ Ch. *bi wenfa yi shenqi yanxin, yu wuqyun guancha wuchang ku kong wuwo*. 彼聞法已深起厭心、於五取蘊觀察無常·苦·空·無我。 “She, having heard the Dharma, deeply conceived a mind disgusted (at the world) and observed the five aggregates as impermanent, painful, empty, and selfless.”

⁵⁶ Skt. *sarvagleśaprahāṇād*. Ch. has two different readings: *yi zhijingangchu huai zhu fannao* 以智金剛杵壞諸煩惱 “destroyed various afflictions with the vajra of knowledge” (first and second Goryeo

free from desire in the three spheres; she looked upon gold and a lump of dirt equally; her mind observed space and the palm of the hand equally; she accepted being cut by an adze and being anointed with sandalwood paste as the same, wherefore her eggshell of ignorance was shattered; she attained knowledge, supernatural knowledge, and special knowledge; she turned her face away from attachment to desire of existence and honors; (P 162a) and she became an object of veneration, respect, and deference from the gods including Indra and Upendra.⁵⁷

Dharmadinnā Performs Miracles and Preaches the Dharma

There is no possibility, no reason that a nun who is an *arhantī*, who has destroyed impure influence, (D 167b) stays at home as a laywoman and no reason that she enjoys experience of desires in order to take pleasure. When Dharmadinnā had realized the state of an *arhantī* and said to her parents: “Father and Mother, (T. 368c) because I have realized the state of an *arhantī*, please allow me to go to the nunnery King’s Garden,” (S 250a) the householder Byin pa and his wife, having conferred in secret, said: “My daughter, if it is so, will the king not injure us? In this regard, conduct yourself in

version); *yi zhijingangchu cui ershi zhong youshenjianshan* 以智金剛杵摧二十種有身見山 “demolished the mountains of the twenty kinds of false views of individuality with the vajra of knowledge” (the Song, Yuan, Ming, and old Song editions) (see T. 1451, 24.368 n. 6; for the first Goryeo version, see K893, vol. 22, 839b, http://kb.sutra.re.kr/ritk_eng/index.do). Nishimoto (1935, 240 n. 54) notes these variants and accepts the latter reading in his translation. This phrase including “with the vajra of knowledge” in both variants must be the result of a confusion of the stock passage about attaining the *arhathood* (see note 54) with the stock passage about stream-entry (*vimśatiśikharasamudgataṃ satkāyadr̥ṣṭiśailaṃ jñānavajrena bhittvā* “leveled the twenty peaks of the mountain chain of the false view of individuality with the vajra of knowledge”), which we have already seen in this story (D 163b1–2). It is likely that “destroyed various afflictions” is an emendation to “demolished the mountains of the twenty kinds of false views of individuality” by an editor who found it duplicated in the story.

⁵⁷ Ch. *shi fan zhutian* 釋梵諸天 “Śakra, Brahman, and various gods.”

due course and go together with the Blessed One.”

She replied: “Great. I will do so.”

Then the householder Byin pa invited the Order of monks headed by the Buddha to his house and sent a message to the householder Ri dags sgra: “My friend, my daughter Dharmadinnā is not able to live at home and she is certainly going forth. Come and accept her quickly.”

The householder Ri dags sgra also reported to King Prasenajit of Kosala,⁵⁸ and his friends, brothers, relatives, and many people assembled and stayed there.

The householder Byin pa,⁵⁹ having prepared various foods, which were pure and fine, during the night, got up early in the morning, arranged seats, set a filled pitcher, and let the Blessed One know the time by messenger: “Reverend One, the meal is ready and the mealtime has come. May the Blessed One know it is the time.”

The Blessed One dressed early in the morning, took his bowl and his robe and, surrounded by many monks, went to the house of the householder Byin pa, (S 250b) followed by the Order of monks. When he had arrived there, (P 162b) the Blessed One sat on the seat arranged before the Order of monks. Then the householder Byin pa surrounded by his friends, brothers, and relatives,

⁵⁸ Ch. narrates what Ri dags sgra said to the king in detail: *chen gong tianyu xian you chengyan zhifuweiqin. binü jin yu shesu chujia, chen jiang zhuqin qiangwei hungou.* 臣共天與先有誠言指腹爲親。彼女今欲捨俗出家、臣將諸親強爲婚媾。 “I have before with *Devadatta made a promise of the engagement of our unborn children (lit. ‘made a promise to marry [our children] by pointing at the bellies’). That daughter (of *Devadatta) now wants to abandon the secular life and go forth from home. Leading my relatives, I will perform the wedding by force.”

⁵⁹ For Skt. sources and Ch. parallels for this stock passage, “The householder ... having prepared ... with his own hands,” see Hiraoka 2002, 182–183. See also 2007, i: 129 and 140 n. 79–84; Rotman 2008, 130–131.

having known that the Buddha and (D 168a) the Order of monks had sat down in comfort, served and satisfied them with various foods, which were pure and fine, with his own hands.

At that time the householder Ri dags sgra, together with his friends, brothers, relatives, princes, officers, citizens, and provincial dwellers, having performed ceremonies that bring protection, blessings, and peace to his son Viśākha, set forth to accept the bride and sat down in front of the door of the householder Byin pa's house.

When the householder Byin pa had served and satisfied the Buddha and the Order of monks with his own hands, he, knowing the Blessed One had finished his meal, washed his hands, and put his bowl away, took a low seat and sat with his friends, brothers, and relatives before the Blessed One in order to hear the Dharma. Then the Blessed One, through talk consistent with the Dharma, instructed, (S 251a) inspired, encouraged, and delighted the householder Byin pa, his friends, brothers, and relatives. When he had instructed, inspired,⁶⁰ encouraged, and delighted them through talk consistent with the Dharma in a variety of ways, the Blessed One rose from his seat and departed. The nun Dharmadinnā attained a remedy against [defilements of] the three worlds and attained fearlessness. When the time to accept the bride had arrived, the householder Ri dags sgra's son Viśākha played various cymbals together with the friends, brothers, relatives, princes, officers, citizens, and many provincial dwellers. Dharmadinnā desired to go out following the

⁶⁰ *S yang dag par bskul*: DP om.

Blessed One. Then the householder Ri dags sgra's son Viśākha suddenly extended his arm and took Dharmadinnā's hand.⁶¹ (P 163a) Dharmadinnā, beheld by innumerable hundreds of thousands of living beings, soared high into the sky as if a *haṃsa* king (D 168b) expanded its wings and displayed various miracles. Then the householder Ri dags sgra's friends, brothers, relatives, princes, officers, citizens, many provincial dwellers, the householder Ri dags sgra's son Viśākha, and spectators (S 251b) were greatly amazed, bowed down to her feet like trees that were cut from the roots and said: "Sister, since you have attained a number of such qualities, there is no possibility, no reason that you would engage in worldly desire. Please forgive us."

Then Dharmadinnā alighted from the sky, (T. 369a) sat before many people and preached the Dharma, having heard which hundreds of thousands of living beings attained great excellence. Some realized the fruit of stream-entry, some the fruit of once-returning, some the fruit of not-returning and some went forth in the teachings of the Blessed One, abandoned all impurities, and realized the state of an *arhat*. Some generated intent towards the enlightenment of disciples, some towards the enlightenment of Self-enlightened Ones, and some towards the complete and supreme enlightenment. Most of the audience became absorbed in the Buddha, devoted to the Dharma, and inclined to the Order.⁶² After that, the nun Dharmadinnā, having acquired

⁶¹ Finnegan notes that this act of the bridegroom, taking the bride's hand, is a key ritual moment in brahmanical wedding ceremonies (2009, 206 n. 415).

⁶² For Skt. sources and Ch. parallels for this stock passage "preached the Dharma, ... inclined to the Order," see Hiraoka 2002, 186–187.

attainment and perfection and made great benefits for living beings, went to the Blessed One and bowed low until her forehead touched the feet of the Blessed One to show her deference, and departed from in front of the Blessed One.

(S 252a) Then the Blessed One said to the monks: “Thus among my nuns, female disciples who have been ordained, receiving my authorization, (P 163b) and preach the Dharma, this Dharmadinnā is the best.”⁶³

The Former Life of Dharmadinnā

The monks, experiencing some uncertainty, asked the Buddha, the Blessed One, who cuts off all uncertainty: (D 169a) “Reverend One, what action did the nun Dharmadinnā create, because of which she went forth and was ordained by messenger staying at home and attained nunhood, realized the state of an *arhantī* at the very place and she was said to be the best of those who

⁶³ In *Karmaśataka* 36, Viśākha permits her to go forth: *bdag gis khyod de bzhin du ghang ngo// yo byad thams cad kyang sbyar bar bya ste khyod la ci dgos pa de dag thams cad bdag gis sbyin no* “I permit you [to go forth] just as [you wish to do so]. I will have all necessities prepared, and I will give you all the things you need.” (D 340, *mDo sde* Ha 137b1). More noteworthy is that *Karmaśataka* 36 neither describes the conversion of people nor mentions the Buddha’s praise of her ability in preaching but only says: *de nas chos byin mas de dag la chos kyi gtam gyis yang dag par bstan/ yang dag par ’dzin du bcug/ yang dag par gzengs bstod/ yang dag par dga’ bar byas nas song ngo//* “Then Dharmadinnā through talk consistent with the Dharma, instructed, attracted, encouraged, and delighted them and departed” (Ha 137b2). Hereafter *Karmaśataka* 36 states that Dharmadinnā went forth after going to the nunnery, was conferred the precepts of a novice and probationer, and was given the consent to enter the pure life. Then it explains how Dharmadinnā was confronted by a danger of abduction on the way to the Jetavana, and consequently the Buddha authorized the nuns to ordain her by messenger, which is similar to the stories about the rules for ordination by messenger in the extant *vinayas* other than the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*. Note, however, that in the *Karmaśataka* version the ordination takes place at Dharmadinnā’s father’s house and in the nunnery in these *vinayas*. It is also important that the *Karmaśataka* version abbreviates the ordination procedure: *gzhung las ji skad ’byung ba bzhin du rgyas par brjod par bya ’o//* “It should be related in detail just as it appears in the scripture” (Ha 137b2). See Yao 2015, 231–233. The *Karmaśataka*, after Dharmadinnā’s ordination, tells her attainment of the state of an *arhantī*.

preach the Dharma by the Blessed One?”

The Blessed One said: “Monks, the actions which had been created and accumulated by the nun Dharmadinnā, which had attained their preparation and which had ripened their condition, were inevitable and they approached her like a flood. The actions that had been created and accumulated by Dharmadinnā will not be undergone by others. Monks, actions created and accumulated do not mature in the element of earth, the element of water, the element of fire, or the element of wind, which are out of body. Virtuous and vicious actions that have been created do mature in the aggregates, elements, and spheres that are connected to sense:

“Even after hundreds of *kalpas*, actions are never lost. (S 252b)

“They, when the time has come, get an assemblage and fruit in those who have body.”⁶⁴

“Monks, once, when people’s lives were twenty thousand years long, in this very good eon, there appeared in the world a teacher named Kāśyapa,⁶⁵ who was a Tathāgata, Arhat, Perfectly Enlightened One, Perfect in Knowledge and Conduct, Sugata, World-Knowing, Supreme Driver of People to be Tamed, Teacher of Gods and Humans, Buddha, and Blessed One.⁶⁶ He stayed in the city of Vārāṇasī⁶⁷ and stayed in the Rṣivadana Deer-Park. At that time there lived a householder in

⁶⁴ For Skt. sources and Ch. parallels for this stock passage, “The monks, experiencing some uncertainty ... fruit in those who have body,” see Hiraoka 2002, 167–168. Ch. abbreviates a part of this stock passage: “Monks, actions created and accumulated do not mature ... actions that have been created do mature.”

⁶⁵ Tib. *'od srung*; Ch. *jiashēbo* 迦攝波 (a phonetical transliteration of Kāśyapa).

⁶⁶ These titles of the Buddha are abbreviated in Ch. *shihao juzu* 十號具足 “[he] possessed ten titles.”

⁶⁷ Tib. *yul 'khor mo 'jig gi grong kher*; Ch. *poluoniesi* 婆羅痾斯 (a phonetical transliteration of Vārāṇasī).

Vārāṇasī. He took a wife from a family that was equal to his, and he and she (P 164a) made love. They made love there and later the wife conceived a child. After eight or (D 169b) nine months, a girl was born. He held a great festivity at birth for three times seven, [i.e.] twenty-one, days and gave her a name suitable to her family.

“Later when she had grown, she wished to go forth but her parents did not allow her to go forth. There was an old nun (S 253a) who was a family teacher of that home and often came to the home. The girl said to the old nun: ‘Noble One, I hope to go forth and be ordained in the well-taught Dharma and Vinaya, and attain nunhood, but my parents do not allow it and prevent me even from going out. Could you let me go forth in this very place?’

“She (the nun) replied: ‘Girl, I shall ask the Blessed One and manage it.’

“She asked the Blessed One, the Perfectly Enlightened One Kāśyapa, and she was sent as a messenger. After she let the girl, who was staying at home, go forth and conferred the precepts of a nun upon her, the two Orders ordained the girl. The old nun preached the Dharma to the girl and the girl, staying at home, realized the state of an *arhantī*.⁶⁸

“After that, the old nun thought:⁶⁹ ‘It is all due to me that this girl, staying at home, went forth and attained the precepts and ordination by messenger, and that she, staying at home, realized

⁶⁸ After this account of attainment of *arhatship*, Ch. says: *bifo chengzan shuofani zhong zuiwei diyi*. 彼佛稱讚說法尼中最為第一。 “The Buddha praised her as the best of the nuns who preach the Dharma.”

⁶⁹ The following passage has a strong resemblance to parts of the story of an old woman Kacaṅgalā in the *Bhaiṣajyavastu* (GM i 23.15–24.4; Kha 133a5–b1; T. 24.44c29).

the state of an *arhantī*. (T. 369b) By the root of merit from my leading the pure life in the period of the Blessed One, the Perfectly Enlightened One Kāśyapa, may I go forth and attain the precepts and nunhood staying at home by messenger (D 170a), and realize the state of *arhantī* staying at home like this (girl) in the teaching of the Buddha Śākyamuni whom the young brahmin Uttara⁷⁰ was predicted to become: “Young brahmin, (S 253b) you will become a Tathāgata, Arhat, Perfectly Enlightened One called Śākyamuni when people’s lives are a hundred years long” (P 164b) by the Blessed One, the Perfectly Enlightened One Kāśyapa.⁷¹ As my teacher was praised as the best of those who preach the Dharma, may I be praised as the best of those who preach the Dharma by Śākyamuni, the Blessed One, the King of Śākyas, too.⁷²

“What do you think, monks? That one who was the old nun is indeed this nun Dharmadinnā.

She once led the pure life in the presence of the Blessed One, the Perfectly Enlightened One

⁷⁰ *bla ma*. Ch. does not mention the name but mention only *monapo* 摩納婆, Skt. *māṇava*, “young brahmin.” See the next note.

⁷¹ This story of Uttara appears twice in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*: in the *Bhaiṣajyavastu* (GM i: 217.11–14/fol. 219v5 = GBM 1071b5 = Clarke 2014b, 113; Ga 4a1–10a4; T. 24.96b13–16; Hofinger 1990, 35–45 and 102–115 [Tibetan text and French translation]; Yao 2013, 518–524 [Japanese translation]) and the *Sanḅhabhedavastu* (Sbhv ii: 22–30; Nga 124b5–131a6; T 24.157a–158c). For the abbreviation of the story in Skt. and Ch. and its full occurrence in Tib. in the *Bhaiṣajyavastu*, see Yao 2012, 303–304. For other parallels, see Murakami 1984, 195–196 n. 6 and Anālayo 2011a, i: 441 n. 3–4. For comparative studies of this story, see Anālayo 2009 and 2011a, i: 441–451.

⁷² Although the old nun suddenly refers to her teacher here, explaining that the teacher “was praised as the best of those who preach the Dharma,” there is no other mention of her teacher in any other part of this story. In contrast, Ch. is much more coherent: there the younger nun is praised by the Buddha (see note 68), and the old nun refers not to her own teacher but to this younger nun, “*ci ni* 此尼,” when she makes a wish.

In the story of Kacaṅgalā in the *Bhaiṣajyavastu* (see note 69), the Buddha Kāśyapa praises the teacher of a nun, the protagonist in her previous life, as “the best of those who preach the Dharma,” and the nun makes a wish to earn such praise in the future. Given the similarity between the two wishes in these stories in the Mūlasarvāstivāda *Vinaya*, it is likely that the incoherence in Tib. mentioned above results from the careless application of the wording of Kacaṅgalā’s story to Dharmadinnā’s story when the latter was composed. And, if so, the passage in Ch. of Dharmadinnā’s story might be a result of a later editorial effort to make better sense. However, this is only a possibility, and there could be some other explanations.

Kāśyapa. By the power of her wish, she, staying at home, went forth and attained the precepts and nunhood by messenger. And she, having been ordained, abandoned all impurities and realized the state of an *arhantī*, staying at home. And she was also praised by the Tathāgata as the best of those who preach the Dharma.⁷³

“Therefore, monks, the maturation of entirely black actions (S 254a) is entirely black; the maturation of entirely white actions is entirely white; the maturation of those that are mixed is mixed. Therefore, monks, you should abandon black actions and those actions that are mixed, and should make efforts only with entirely white actions. You, monks, must learn like this.”⁷⁴

Thus said the Blessed One, and the monks felt delighted and praised what the Blessed One said.

⁷³ *Karmaśataka* 36 gives two stories of Dharmadinnā’s past lives (D 340, *mDo sde* Ha 137b5–138b7; 138b7–142a6), the first of which is to some extent similar to the above past life story in the *Kṣudrakavastu* version. But in this past life story the protagonist is confronted not by any objection to going forth from her parents but by some problem that occurs when she goes out for ordination after having gone forth like Dharmadinnā in the story of the present. The second past life story is about the adventures of a young merchant’s wife, who defends her chastity during her solitary travel until she is reunited with her husband. See Yao 2015, 233. The Merv *avadāna* manuscript gives a short summary of a story of Dharmadinnā’s previous life in the time of the Buddha Kāśyapa, which, however, seems to be to some extent different from our story (Karashima and Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya 2015, 212–213).

⁷⁴ For Skt. sources and Ch. parallels for this stock passage, “Therefore, monks ... You, monks, must learn like this,” see Hiraoka 2002, 168–169.

Acknowledgment

My heartfelt gratitude goes to Professor Shayne Clarke for his careful reading of the draft of this paper and many comments and corrections. I thank also Dr. Lozang Jampal and Mr. Thomas Fischer for providing me with their unpublished translation of the *Karmaśataka*. Mr. Fischer gave me a number of helpful suggestions. The anonymous reviewer's comments enabled me to improve my draft on a number of points. But all errors in the article are my own. This research was supported by JSPS KAKENHI Grant Number 24·3594.

Abbreviations

- D Derge Xylograph (Ui et al. 1934 for numbering)
- Divy *Divyāvadāna* (Cowell and Neil [1886] 1987)
- GBM *Gilgit Buddhist Manuscripts* (Raghu Vira and Lokesh Chandra [1959–74] 1995)
- GM *Gilgit Manuscripts* vol. III (Dutt [1942–50] 1984)
- Mvy *Mahāvyutpatti* (Sakaki [1916] 1998)
- P Peking Xylograph

- S sTog Palace Manuscript
- Sbhv *Saṅghabhedavastu* (Gnoli 1977–78)
- T *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō* 大正新脩大藏經

Bibliography

- Anālayo. 2009. “The Bodhisattva and Kassapa Buddha—A Study Based on the *Madhyama-āgama* Parallel to the *Ghaṭikāra-sutta*.” *The Indian International Journal of Buddhist Studies* 10:1–33.
- . 2011a. *A Comparative Study of the Majjhima-nikāya*. 2 vols. Taipei: Dharma Drum Publishing Corporation.
- . 2011b. “*Chos sbyin gyi mdo*—Bhikṣuṇī Dharmadinnā Proves Her Wisdom.” *Chung-Hwa Buddhist Journal* 24:3–34.
- Bapat, P. V. and V. V. Gokhale 1982. *Vinaya-Sūtra and Auto-Commentary on the Same by Guṇaprabha: Chapter I Pravrajyā-vastu*. Patna: K. P. Jayaswal Research Institute.
- Chung, Jin-il. 2006. “Ursprung und Wandel der Aufnahme von Frauen in den buddhistischen Orden nach der kanonischen Überlieferung: eine Randbemerkung.” *Annual of the Sanko Research Institute for the Studies of Buddhism* 37:1–16.

Clarke, Shayne. 2001. “The *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya Mukta* 根本説一切有部目得迦.” *Buddhist Studies* 30:81–107.

———. 2014a. *Family Matters in Indian Buddhist Monasticisms*. Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press.

———. 2014b. *Vinaya Texts*. Gilgit Manuscripts in the National Archives of India: Facsimile Edition, vol. 1. New Delhi: National Archives of India, Tokyo: International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University.

———. 2015. “Vinayas.” *Brill’s Encyclopedia of Buddhism*, vol. 1: Literature and Languages, edited by Jonathan A. Silk, 60–87. Leiden and Boston: Brill.

Cowell, Edward Byles and Robert Alexander Neil. [1886] 1987. *The Divyāvadāna, a Collection of Early Buddhist Legends*. Delhi: Indological Book House.

Dutt, Nalinaksha. [1942–50] 1984. *Gilgit Manuscripts*, vol. 3 in 4 parts. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications.

Edgerton, Franklin. [1953] 1998. *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary*. 2 vols. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.

Eimer, Helmut. 1983. *Rab tu ’byun ba’i gzi: Die tibetische Übersetzung des Pravrajyāvastu im Vinaya der Mūlasarvāstivādins*. 2 vols. Wiesbaden: Otto Harrassowitz.

Feer, Léon. 1901. “Le Karma-Çataka.” *Journal asiatique* 9^e série, tome 17:53–100, 257–315, 410–486.

Finnegan, Damchö Diana. 2009. “‘For the Sake of Women, Too’: Ethics and Gender in the Narratives of the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya*.” PhD. diss., the University of Wisconsin-Madison.

Gnoli, Raniero. 1977–78. *The Gilgit Manuscript of the Saṅghabhedavastu: Being the 17th and Last Section of the Vinaya of the Mūlasarvāstivādin*. 2 vols. Serie Orientale Roma 49(1–2). Roma: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.

Heirman, Ann. 2002. “*The Discipline in Four Parts*”: *Rules for Nuns according to the Dharmaguptakavinaya*. 3 vols. Buddhist Tradition Series 47. Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass.

Hirakawa, Akira 平川 彰. [1964] 2000. *Genshi bukkyō no kyōdan soshiki* 原始仏教の教団組織 [The Structure and Form of the Primitive Buddhist Order]. 2 vols. Tokyo: Shunjūsha. Originally titled *Genshi bukkyō no kenkyū: Kyōdan soshiki no genkei* 原始仏教の研究—教団組織の原型— [A Study of Early Buddhism: The Original Form of the Order’s Structure].

———. 1998. *Bikuniritsu no kenkyū* 比丘尼律の研究 [A Study of the *Bhikṣuṇī-vinaya*]. Tokyo: Shunjūsha.

Hiraoka, Satoshi 平岡 聡. 2002. *Setsuwa no kōkogaku: Indo bukkyō setsuwa ni himerareta shisō* 説話の考古学: インド仏教説話に秘められた思想 [Archaeology of Narratives: Thoughts hidden in Indian Buddhist Narratives]. Tokyo: Daizō Shuppan.

———. 2007. *Budda ga nazotoku sanze no monogatari: Divya-avadāna zenyaku* ブッダが謎解く三世の物語 『ディヴィヤ・アヴァダーナ』全訳 [The Stories of the Past, Present, and Future Revealed by the Buddha: A Complete Translation of the *Divyāvadāna*], 2 vols. Tokyo: Daizō Shuppan.

———. 2009. “Text Critical remarks on the *Divyāvadāna* (1).” *Annual Report of the International*

Research Institute for Advanced Buddhism 12:29–72.

———. 2011. “Review Article: The *Divyāvadāna* in English.” *Indo-Iranian Journal* 54:231–270.

<https://doi.org/10.1163/001972411X552409>

Hirata, Masahiro, Nozomi Itagaki, Kenji Uchida, Masaaki Hanada and Masahito Kawai. 2013.

“Ko-chūki indo-āria bunken ‘Veda bunken’ ‘Pāli seiten’ ni motozuita minami ajia no kodai nyūseihiin no saigen to dōtei 古・中期インド・アーリア文献「Veda 文献」「Pāli 聖典」に基づいた南アジアの古代乳製品の再現と同定 [Reproduction and identification of ancient dairy products in South Asia based on the old and middle Indo-Aryan literatures, ‘Vedic ritual’ and ‘Pāli canon’].” *Nihon Chikusan Gakkaihō* 日本畜産学会報 84(2): 175–190.

<https://doi.org/10.2508/chikusan.84.175>

Hofinger, Marcel. 1990. *Le congrès du Lac Anavatapta (Vies de saints bouddhiques): Extrait du Vinaya des*

Mūlasarvāstivādin Bhaiṣajyavastu 2, Légendes du Buddha (Buddhāvadāna). Louvain-la-Neuve:

Université Catholique de Louvain, Institut orientaliste.

Honjō, Yoshifumi 本庄 良文. 2014. *Kusharonchū Upāikā no kenkyū: Yakuchūhen* 俱舍論註ウパーイ

カーの研究 訳註篇 [A Study of the *Upāyikā*, the commentary on the *Abhidharmakośa*: An

Annotated Translation]. 2 vols. Tokyo: Daizō Shuppan.

Jampal, Lozang and Thomas Fischer. Forthcoming. *The Hundred Deeds*.

Hu-von Hinüber, Haiyan. 1994. *Das Poṣadhavastu: Vorschriften für die buddhistische Beichtfeier im*

Vinaya der Mūlasarvāstivādins. Reinbek: Verlag für Orientalistische Fachpublikationen.

Karashima, Seishi and Margarita I. Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya. 2015. “The Avadāna Anthology from Merv, Turkmenistan.” In *Buddhist Manuscripts from Central Asia: The St. Petersburg Sanskrit Fragments (StPSF)*, vol. 1, edited by Seishi Karashima and Margarita I. Vorobyova-Desyatovskaya, 145–523. Tokyo: The Institute of Oriental Manuscripts of the Russian Academy of Sciences and the International Research Institute for Advanced Buddhology, Soka University.

Kieffer-Pülz, Petra. 1992. *Die Sīmā: Vorschriften zur Regelung der buddhistischen Gemeindegrenze in älteren buddhistischen Texten*. Monographien zur indischen Archäologie, Kunst und Philologie 8. Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag.

Kishino Ryōji. 2015. “The Concept of *sdom pa* in the *Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya*: On Possible Misunderstandings of the *Brahmacaryopasthāna-saṃvṛti*.” *The Bulletin of the Association of Buddhist Studies, Bukkyo University* 20:147–192.

Kritzer, Robert. 2014. *Garbhāvakraṅtisūtra: The Sūtra on Entry into the Womb*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies.

Li, Shenghai. 2012. “Candrakīrti’s Āgama: A Study of the Concept and Uses of Scripture in Classical Indian Buddhism.” PhD. diss., University of Wisconsin-Madison.

Matsumoto, Junko 松本 純子. 2005. “Shukke wo nozonda hanayome no monogatari 出家を望んだ花嫁の物語—『カルマンヤタカ』第 36 話和訳 [The Tale of a Bride Who Wished to Be a Nun:

A Japanese Translation of *Karmaśataka* 36].” *Kobayashi Enshō hakushi koki kinen ronshū: Bukkyō no shisō to bunka no shosō* 小林圓照博士古稀記念論集 佛教の思想と文化の諸相 [Aspects of Buddhist Thought and Culture: Essays in Honour of Professor Enshō Kobayashi’s 70th Year] (special issue of *Zengaku kenkyū* 禪學研究 [Studies in Zen Buddhism]): 177–193.

Muldoon-Hules, Karen Maria. 2010. “Brides of the Buddha and Other Stories: Reading the Women’s Stories of the 8th Varga of the *Avadānaśataka* in Context.” PhD. diss., University of California, Los Angeles.

Murakami, Shinkan 村上真完. 1984. *Saiiki no bukyō: Bezekuriku seiganga kō* 西域の仏教: ベゼクリク誓願画考 [The Prañidhi Scenes of the Cave Temples at Bezeklik in Chinese Turkestan]. Tokyo: Daisanbunmei sha.

Nishimoto, Ryūzan 西本龍山. 1935. *Ritsubu* 律部 [Vinaya Section] 26, *Kokuyaku issaikyō* 國譯一切經 [Translation into the National Language of the Complete Buddhist Canon]. Tokyo: Daitō shuppansha.

Nishimura, Naoko. 2014. “Processing of Dairy Products in the Vedic Ritual, Compared with Pāli.” In *Vedic Studies: Language, Text, Culture and Philosophy, Proceedings of the 15th World Sanskrit Conference*, edited by Hans Henrich Hock, 211–242. New Delhi: D.K. Printworld.

Panglung, Jampa Losang. 1981. *Die Erzählstoffe des Mūlasarvāstivāda-Vinaya: Analysiert auf Grund der tibetischen Übersetzung*. Studia Philologica Buddhica: Monograph Series 3. Tokyo: The Reiyukai

Library.

Raghu Vira and Lokesh Chandra. [1959–74] 1995. *Gilgit Buddhist Manuscripts*. 3 vols. Delhi: Sri Satguru Publications.

Rotman, Andy. 2008. *Divine Stories: Divyāvadāna Part 1*. Boston: Wisdom Publications.

Sakaki, Ryōzaburō 榑 亮三郎. [1916] 1998. *Bonzōkanwa shiyaku taikō hon'yaku myōgi taishū* 梵藏漢和四譯對校 翻譯名義大集 [A quadrilingual Sanskrit-Tibetan-Chinese-Japanese edition of the *Mahāvvyutpatti*]. Kyoto: Rinsen Shoten.

Schmidt, Michael. 1993. “Bhikṣuṇī-Karmavācanā: Die Handschrift Sansk. c.25(R) der Bodleian Library Oxford.” In *Studien zur Indologie und Buddhismuskunde. Festgabe des Seminars für Indologie und Buddhismuskunde für Professor Dr. Heinz Bechert zum 60. Geburtstag am 26. Juni 1992*, edited by Reinhold Grünendahl, Jens-Uwe Hartmann and Petra Kieffer-Pülz: 239–288. Bonn: Indica et Tibetica Verlag.

Shōno, Masanori. 2010. “A reedited text of *Varṣāvastu* in the *Vinayavastu* and a Tentative Re-edited Text of the *Vārṣikavastu* in the *Vinayasūtra*.” *Acta Tibetica et Buddhica* 3:1–128.

Skilling, Peter. 1999. “‘Arise, go forth, devote yourselves ...’: A verse summary of the teaching of the Buddhas.” *Socially Engaged Buddhism for the New Millennium: Essays in Honor of the Ven. Phra Dhammapitaka (Bhikkhu P.A. Payutto) on His 60th Birthday Anniversary*, edited by Sulak Sivaraksa, 440–444. Bangkok: Sathirakoses-Nagapradipa Foundation & Foundation For Children.

Teiser, Stephen F. 2006. *Reinventing the Wheel: Paintings of Rebirth in Medieval Buddhist Temples*.

Seattle & London: University of Washington Press.

Ui, Hakuju, Suzuki Munetada, Kanakura Yenshō, and Tada Tōkan. 1934. *A Complete Catalogue of the*

Tibetan Buddhist Canons (Bkaḥ-ḥgyur and Bstan-ḥgyur). Sendai: Tōhoku Imperial University.

Yamagiwa, Nobuyuki. 2001. *Das Pāṇḍulohitakavastu: Über die verschiedenen Verfahrensweisen der*

Bestrafung in der buddhistischen Gemeinde. Indica et Tibetica 41. Marburg: Indica et Tibetica

Verlag.

Yao, Fumi 八尾 史. 2012. “‘Konponsetsuissaiuburitsu’ yakuji ni okeru kyōten ‘inyō’ no shosō 3

『根本説一切有部律』「薬事」における経典「引用」の諸相（三） [Sutras quoted in the

Bhaiṣajyavastu of the Mūlasarvāstivāda-vinaya (3)].” *Bukkyō kenkyū* 佛教研究 40:291-318.

———. 2013. *Konponsetsuissaiuburitsu yakuji* 根本説一切有部律薬事 [The *Bhaiṣajyavastu of the*

Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya (annotated Japanese translation)]. Tokyo: Rengō Shuppan.

———. 2015. “The Story of Dharmadinnā: Ordination by Messenger in the *Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya*.”

Indo-Iranian Journal 58(3): 216-253. <https://doi.org/10.1163/15728536-05800062>